

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
FOR THE EASTERN DISTRICT OF PENNSYLVANIA**

---

**GERALD WILLIAMS-BEY,**

**Plaintiff,**

**v.**

**PHILADELPHIA HOUSING AUTHORITY,  
et al.,**

**Defendants.**

---

**:  
: CIVIL ACTION  
:  
:  
: No. 18-05096  
:  
:  
:  
:  
:  
:**

**ORDER**

**AND NOW**, this 21<sup>st</sup> day of February, 2020, upon consideration of the Motion to Dismiss by Defendants Branville G. Bard, Jr., Glenn Eskridge, and the Philadelphia Housing Authority (collectively, “the PHA Defendants”) (Doc. No. 21), the Second Motion to Dismiss by Defendant City of Philadelphia (Doc. No. 22), Plaintiff’s Response (Doc. No. 29), and the PHA Defendants’ Reply (Doc. No. 32), it is hereby **ORDERED** that:

1. Defendant City of Philadelphia’s Motion to Dismiss (Doc. No. 22) is **DENIED**.
2. The PHA Defendants’ Motion to Dismiss (Doc. No. 21) is **GRANTED** as to Plaintiff’s claim for punitive damages against the PHA and against Defendants Bard and Eskridge in their official capacities, but is **DENIED** in all other respects.
3. All claims against Defendant Vanessa C. Hall are **DISMISSED** for lack of prosecution.

It is **FURTHER ORDERED**, that within **twenty-one (21) days** from the date of this Order, Defendants shall file an Answer to the Amended Complaint.

**BY THE COURT:**

/s/ Mitchell S. Goldberg  
**MITCHELL S. GOLDBERG, J.**